

Nogent-sur-Marne, January 5, 2018

Mr. Nicolas Hulot  
Minister of the Ecological and Inclusive  
Transition  
246 boulevard Saint-Germain  
75007 PARIS

Mrs. Agnès Buzyn  
Minister of Solidarity and Health  
14 avenue Duquesne  
75007 PARIS

Mr. Bruno Le Maire  
Minister of Economy and Finance  
139 rue de Bercy  
75012 Paris

**Subject: New request for intervention to preserve the health and safety of users of mobile phones (letter by LRAR)**

Dear Madam, Dear Sirs,

I have the honor to write to you, following my letter of June 19, 2017 addressed to the State Minister, the Minister of the Ecological and Inclusive Transition and the Minister of Solidarity and Health, which has for now remained unanswered. The letter requested them to intervene as rapidly as possible in order to protect the health of millions of French citizens, users of mobile phones, including hundreds of thousands of children.

This letter also informed its recipients of the serious malfunctions concerning the test protocols for the Specific Absorption Rate (SAR) « body », which for more than twenty years have allowed manufacturers of the sector to place on the French as well as European markets mobile phones presenting serious risks for the health and safety of their users.

In order to be perfectly clear, I am attaching an extract of the list of brands and models of mobile phones whose SAR “trunk” and “extremities” have been measured between 2012 and 2016 by the National Frequencies Agency (ANFR) and exceed the regulatory threshold of 2 W/kg at contact and at “near-contact” with the body (5mm).

The phones tested by ANFR include those most currently used by consumers. Thus, the Samsung Galaxy J3, which represented more than 6% of sales in France in 2017, has a SAR “trunk” at contact of 2.92 W/kg while it is displayed at 0.346 W/kg (test conducted in July 2016). It is the same for the Samsung Galaxy J5 (6% of sales) whose actual SAR is 2.52 W/kg instead of that displayed by the manufacturer at 0.481 W/kg (test from May 2016). Apple’s iPhone 6S (3.3% of sales in 2017) has an actual SAR of 2.59 W/kg. It is the same for a large number of the most widely-sold mobile phones in France.

These measurement results, obtained by me from ANFR after several legal and media actions, are only partial. The reason is that ANFR, despite the notification of the Commission for Access to Administrative Documents (CADA) received in April 2017 and the fact that the afore-mentioned ministers to whom the letters were addressed, were informed, decided again to delay the publication of all the measurement reports. ANFR, however, had committed to me in writing in July 2017 to publish them in September, and then retracted in October, obliging me again to take the case before the Administrative Court of Melun. Such a lack of transparency alone speaks volumes about the desire of the Agency to hide the elements that are the responsibility of both the manufacturers and those who are meant to monitor them.

It is in this context that the California Department of Public Health decided on December 13, 2017, to publish the new recommendations seeking to better protect users of mobile phones, especially the youngest ones, namely:

- Keep the phone away from the body (not in a pocket, bra or belt holster);
- Limit use of headsets of “hands-free kits” to only communications (do not keep them on to listen, for example, to music)

A few days earlier, the Minister of the Ecological and Inclusive Transition launched an information campaign on the « 6 proper uses » of mobile phones. The campaign did not call for any protective measure while using the phone against the body, continues to recommend the use of a “hands-free kit” without restrictions... and suggests no minimum age for providing children with a mobile phone, merely noting that nearly 75% of them already have a mobile phone before age 14.

And what about the statement repeated in the press release, published on December 1, 2017, announcing the launching of the campaign “... there is no serious and immediate danger...”? This statement is, in my view, utterly misleading in its presentation and does not correspond to scientific reality. For the record, the SAR measures only thermal effects of waves whose “health effects are known and proven”, to quote the exact words of the National Agency for Food, Environmental and Occupational Health and Safety (ANSES) in its July 8, 2016 report. Not only does the SAR improperly report the radiation received, especially by children and young persons, but also the faults in the measurement protocols, announced as “compliant”, are such that some mobile phones are a real danger for the health of their users. This was also the meaning of the recommendations made on this occasion by the committee of experts of ANSES and yet remained unheeded until now.

Such a statement takes us sadly back to other health and industrial scandals, to name but two examples, tobacco and asbestos. Which government would renege today on the imperative need to inform the public of the incurred risks under the pretext that their danger is not immediate? I believe I can affirm without being contradicted by the whole scientific community: not one.

This is what Dr. Annie J. Sasco, former Chief of Unit of Epidemiology for Cancer Prevention at the International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC) – World Health Organization, publicly confirmed in the “Phonegate” press release published on December 15, 2017: « *In May 2011, the IARC classified the exposure to electromagnetic fields as a possible carcinogen. Since then new studies were published, both epidemiological and experimental*

*ones, reinforcing the evidence of carcinogenicity and several other detrimental health effects were described. **With the new data on SAR measured in contact with the body, it becomes more than ever necessary to strengthen the safety recommendations to preserve the health of every one, in particular of fetuses, babies and children.***

Also, how can one choose, as the campaign proposes, a “low SAR”, knowing that the results displayed by the manufacturers in no way correspond to reality in terms of use? A simple glance at the published list on the DATA site of ANFR is undeniable proof of this.

Moreover, following my intervention at the scientific conference in Jackson Hole (USA) organized by the Environmental Health Trust in July 2017, the American Food and Drug Administration (FDA) officially wrote to ANFR and ANSES in order to obtain disclosure of all the documents concerning this public health issue.

At the same time, the Minister for National Education, Jean-Michel Blanquer, announced the ban of mobile phones in primary, junior and middle schools at the start of the next school year. He justified this measure, based on “public health reasons”. This announcement attracted significant international media attention.

With the notable exception of this last very interesting measure, I wanted to express to you my deepest concerns and disappointment at the lack of concrete action by your ministries in the face of such a public health issue. More than eighteen months have been lost since the publication of the ANSES report to inform and alert users of mobile phones which present a risk for their health and safety.

It thus seems to me indispensable to urgently ask you again to intervene as follows:

- Act forcibly through the relevant ministry so that it obliges ANFR without delay to be totally transparent on this subject by having the Agency send me, in accordance with the aforementioned notification of CADA, all the reports on test measurements conducted between 2012 and 2017 and to publish them:
- Inform the public of the risks of mobile phones in contact with the body. This includes making the public aware that mobile phone manufacturers who place on the market phones displaying a misleading SAR “body” value compared to the values established in actual use, are endangering the health of users of these phones:
- Launch a new prevention campaign on the proper use of mobile phones, drawing on that of the California Department of Public Health;
- Withdraw or recondition all mobile phones which, although declared « compliant » with the law, have a higher SAR body than the 2 W/kg limit value with actual use, relying on the test results from ANFR.
- Submit a request to the Directorate General for Competition, Consumer Affairs and Fraud Prevention (DGCCRF) for it to launch a full investigation of the deceptive and unfair practices regarding consumers.

- Review as rapidly as possible with the European Commission the Norm EN50566/2013 as well as the European Directive 2014/53/UE which regulate the placing on the market of mobile phones to ensure both true transparency and the protection of the health of users.

**This extremely alarming situation cannot and must not last any longer. Otherwise, the State will be held responsible for not wanting to take urgent measures to address this new health and industrial scandal, Phonegate.**

I wish to inform you that in the next few days, I intend to make public this letter via a press release, and am available to answer any questions you may have.

Yours faithfully,

Marc Arazi

Doctor of Medicine

Copy:

Mr. Jean-Michel Blanquer  
Minister of National Education  
110 rue de Grenelle  
75007 PARIS

**Attachment :**

- Extract of measurements of ANFR published in ascending order of SAR (La Nouvelle République)